Multiple scales of diversification within natural populations of archaea in hydrothermal chimney biofilms

William J. Brazelton,1,2* Mitchell L. Sogin3 and John A. Baross1,2
1School of Oceanography and 2Center for Astrobiology and Early Evolution, University of Washington, Seattle, WA, USA.
3Josephine Bay Paul Center, Marine Biological Laboratory at Woods Hole, Woods Hole, MA, USA.

Summary
Corroborative data collected from 16S rRNA clone libraries, intergenic transcribed spacer (ITS) region clone libraries, and 16S rRNA hypervariable region tag pyrosequencing demonstrate microdiversity within single-species archaeal biofilms of the Lost City Hydrothermal Field. Both 16S rRNA clone libraries and pyrosequencing of the V6 hypervariable region show that Lost City Methanosarcinales (LCMS) biofilms are dominated by a single sequence, but the pyrosequencing data set also reveals the presence of an additional 1654 rare sequences. Clone libraries constructed with DNA spanning the V6 hypervariable region and ITS show that multiple ITS sequences are associated with the same dominant V6 sequence. Furthermore, ITS variability differed among three chimney samples, and the sample with the highest ITS diversity also contained the highest V6 diversity as measured by clone libraries as well as tag pyrosequencing. These results indicate that the extensive microdiversity detected in V6 tag sequences is an underestimate of genetic diversity within the archaeal biofilms.

Introduction
Biofilms coating carbonate chimneys of the Lost City Hydrothermal Field (Kelley et al., 2005) are dominated by a single 16S rRNA phylotype referred to as Lost City Methanosarcinales (LCMS; Schrenk et al., 2004; Brazelton et al., 2006). Previous studies have shown that >80% of all cells in carbonate chimneys venting 20–90°C, pH 9–11 fluids hybridize to a fluorescent in situ hybridization (FISH) probe specific to LCMS (Schrenk et al., 2004). LCMS has resisted laboratory cultivation, but it is presumed to subsist on the high concentrations of hydrogen and/or methane gas venting from the carbonate chimneys (Kelley et al., 2005).

Previous studies have shown ecologically relevant genetic and physiological diversity within natural populations of archaea and bacteria that initially seemed to contain very little genetic diversity based on 16S rRNA sequences. For example, bacterioplankton with >99% similar 16S rRNA sequences can harbour extensive genomic variation (Thompson et al., 2005) and comprise many ecologically distinct strains (Hunt et al., 2008). Variation in the intergenic transcribed spacer (ITS) region, which is less conserved than 16S rRNA, is often a better predictor of genomic and ecological variation. ITS sequence variation delineates cyanobacterial 'ecotypes' that have substantial differences in genomic content (Rocap et al., 2003) and physiological differences linked to distinct localizations within water columns (West et al., 2001) or microbial mats (Ferris et al., 2003). Environmental sequencing of the ITS region has also proved useful in resolving genetically distinct clusters within uncultivated organisms belonging to the Thermococcales group of thermophilic archaea (Huber et al., 2006), the Group I Crenarchaeota (Schlieper et al., 1998, Nicol et al., 2006), and the SAR11 group of marine bacteria (Garcia-Martinez and Rodriguez-Valera, 2000). In this article we test whether the LCMS phylotype consists of genetically distinct subpopulations by thoroughly exploring the sequence diversity in the 16S rRNA gene as well as the ITS region, utilizing both Sanger sequencing of clone libraries and tag pyrosequencing of the V6 hypervariable region.

Results and discussion

16S rRNA clone library
An archaeal 16S rRNA clone library was constructed (by the DOE Joint Genome Institute) from a single carbonate chimney collected from the main chimney structure at Lost City known as Poseidon (sample LC0424).
Sequences were obtained from 486 clones (GenBank Accession No. FJ791302–FJ791787), all of which showed high sequence similarity to the previously published (Schrenk et al., 2004) 16S rRNA sequence of LCMS. After screening for length and quality, 200 clone sequences each containing at least 1250 bp were selected for further analysis.

All 200 clones were at least 98.8% similar over the 1253 bp alignment, but 163 unique sequences were detected (Fig. 1). Although the evenness of unique sequences is high (Table 1) because the most common sequence was shared by only 36 clones, no other sequence was shared by more than two clones. Most of the variations among sequences were substitutions; insertions and deletions were comparatively rare (Table 1). Similar results are achieved if only the V6 hypervariable region is considered (where the V6 is defined by the primers used for V6 tag pyrosequencing described below). Of the 200 clones, 179 have identical V6 sequences, and the 21 variant clones represent 19 additional sequences.

![Diagram](image1.png)

**Fig. 1.** Comparison of tag pyrosequencing and clone library data from the same carbonate chimney.
A. All sequences from 200 nearly full-length 16S rRNA clones obtained from sample LC0424 were more than 97% similar to each other.
B. Collection of 14,869 tag pyrosequences of the V6 hypervariable region from a different sample (LC1408) of the same chimney revealed much greater diversity.
C. A clone library constructed with DNA from sample LC1408 spanning the V6 hypervariable region and the intergenic transcribed spacer (ITS) region showed more diversity in the ITS region.

### Table 1. Diversity comparison of the 16S rRNA, V6 hypervariable region and ITS region among Lost City carbonate chimney samples.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>Clones or tags</th>
<th>Length (bp)</th>
<th>Unique sequencesb</th>
<th>Total mutation rate (%)</th>
<th>Insertion rate (%)</th>
<th>Deletion rate (%)</th>
<th>Substitution rate (%)</th>
<th>Ti/Tv ratio</th>
<th>Evennessd</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16S rRNA clones LC0424 (full length)</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>1253</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>269/45</td>
<td>0.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC0424 (V6 region)</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>610/10</td>
<td>0.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC0424 (V6 region)</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>610/10</td>
<td>0.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V6-ITS clones (V6 region) LC1408</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>8/0</td>
<td>0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC1404</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>6/0</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC1443</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>12/1</td>
<td>0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V6-ITS clones (ITS region) LC1408</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>360</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>103/7</td>
<td>0.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC1404</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>360</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.0005</td>
<td>0.0005</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>41/0</td>
<td>0.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC1443</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>360</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.0001</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>99/9</td>
<td>0.56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| a. Full sample names: LC0424, H03-072705_R0424; LC1408, 3881-1408; LC1404, 3869-1404; LC1443, 3869-1443.
| b. Unique sequences for V6 pyrosequencing tags were calculated after normalizing samples down to 14,869 total tags.
| c. Ti/Tv ratio is shown as numbers of transitions/transversions for clones and as decimal fraction for tags.
| d. Evenness derived from the Shannon–Weaver index and its standard deviation (see Supplementary Information for details).

© 2009 Society for Applied Microbiology and Blackwell Publishing Ltd, *Environmental Microbiology Reports*, 2, 236–242
Comparing the variant sequences with the most common sequence yields a mutation rate of 0.15% for the nearly full-length gene and 0.16% for the V6 region. Because the sequence differences are rare and mostly unique, it is possible that they could be caused by DNA polymerase error. A Taq DNA polymerase error rate of $2.3 \times 10^{-5}$ per base per cycle (Li et al., 2006), however, would only contribute 0.046% sequence variation after 20 cycles of amplification (JGI Standard Protocol) during the polymerase chain reaction. Therefore, polymerase error is unlikely to account for all of the diversity observed in our clone libraries.

**V6 hypervariable region tag sequences**

We obtained 16 260 tag sequences of the V6 hypervariable region of the archaeal 16S rRNA gene from another sample (LC1408) of the same chimney used for the 16S rRNA clone library. More than 91% of these tags were assigned to the family Methanosarcinaceae by GAST (see Supplementary information for details) and showed an extremely uneven abundance distribution. Of the 14 869 Methanosarcinaceae tags, 75% were identical to the corresponding V6 region of 179 of the 200 full-length 16S rRNA clones. The remaining 25% (3695 tags) comprised 622 different sequences clustering into 235 operational taxonomic units (OTUs) at 97% sequence similarity (Fig. 1).

The second most common V6 tag sequence (representing ~5% of all tags) differs from the dominant sequence by lacking the final GAG at the 3′ end. The deletion was not caused by premature truncation of pyrosequencing extension because in each case the distal primer was accurately sequenced. The sequence GAGAG at the 3′ end of the V6 region is highly conserved in archaeal rRNA, but 0.8% of archaeal sequences, including many methanogens, in the RefHVR_v6 database (http://vamps.mbl.edu) lack the final GAG (S. Huse, pers. comm.). Because this database is derived from traditional Sanger sequencing of clones, the GAG deletion in our data is unlikely to be caused by pyrosequencing error. The lack of this deletion in our clone libraries, however, is puzzling.

Two additional samples (LC1404 and LC1443) collected from a different chimney showed very similar distributions, being dominated by the same sequence with a large diversity of very rare sequences (Fig. 2A). The temperature and fluid chemistry at this chimney was similar to the chimney from which sample LC1408 was collected, although samples LC1404 and LC1443 had much higher cell densities (Table S1). The three samples together contained 72 577 tags assigned to the family Methanosarcinaceae representing 1654 different sequences and 536 operational taxonomic units at 97% sequence similarity. The extreme rarity of the diverse sequences raises questions regarding the effect of pyrosequencing error. Tag abundances decreased substantially with increasing distance from the most dominant sequence, a trend that is consistent with the expected effect of random sequencing error from one dominant template. Some sequences, however, appeared much more frequently than others with the same number of substitutions and indels (prominent peaks in Fig. 2A), so these may represent genuine diversity above a background error rate.

Three additional features of our data argue against a significant contribution from pyrosequencing error to the observed diversity. First, the amount of sequence variation was too high to be generated by pyrosequencing error alone. Comparing all variant V6 tag sequences with the one dominant sequence yielded mutation rates of 0.55–0.71% for the three samples (Table 1), while the error rate associated with the pyrosequencing technique and quality-filtering procedure used in this study should not exceed 0.16% (Huse et al., 2007). Most of the mutations were insertions and deletions, whose pyrosequencing-associated rates can vary depending on the template sequence, but the substitution rates (0.15–0.20%) were also much higher than the maximum expected from pyrosequencing error (0.03%, Huse et al., 2007).

Second, many of the bases with the highest substitution rate in the V6 tags were also the most variable bases in the clone library sequences. Positions outlined with a black box in Fig. 2B were the site of at least two substitutions in clone libraries (including the full-length library described above and the three V6-ITS libraries described below). All of these positions also had greater than average substitution rates in the V6 tag data set (indicated by orange and red shading in Fig. 2B). It is highly unlikely that error introduced by both Sanger sequencing of clone libraries and tag pyrosequencing could cause this correspondence in site-specific substitution rates. Furthermore, the transition/transversion ratios associated with substitutions in the V6 tags were very similar to that found in the full-length clone libraries (Table 1).

Finally, pyrosequencing error alone cannot account for the high similarity between the V6 tag distributions of the two samples from the same chimney (LC1404 and LC1443) compared with that of LC1408, which was collected from a different chimney. Although all three samples are very similar in their complement of abundant sequences (Fig. 2A), only a small proportion of the total sequences were shared among samples (Jaccard similarities of 22–26%) due to the large number of rare sequences. Interestingly, LC1404 and LC1443 both contained fewer unique sequences than sample LC1408 (Table 1), and the Bray-Curtis community similarity between the two samples from the same chimney was higher than the community similarity between samples from different chimneys (see Supplementary information).
Although this comparison involves only three samples and thus is not strong statistical evidence, it is suggestive that small differences in rare V6 tag sequences reflect environmental variation.

**V6-ITS clone libraries**

To directly compare the diversity of the V6 region within the LCMS biofilms with a marker known to be more variable in other organisms (Rocap et al., 2002), we constructed clone libraries of ~1071 bp DNA fragments spanning the 3′ end of the 16S rRNA gene including the V6 hypervariable region and the ITS region between the 16S and 23S rRNA genes. Approximately 150–200 clones were sequenced from each of the same three carbonate chimney samples used for V6 tag pyrosequencing. As expected, nearly all 197 V6-ITS clones from sample LC1408 shared the same V6 sequence that dominated the pyrosequencing data set. Only seven clones had variant V6 sequences (Fig. 1), and each of these was unique and the result of transitions. V6-ITS clones from samples LC1404 and LC1443 were also dominated by a single V6 sequence with only a few variants mostly caused by transitions. Sequencing error cannot be discounted as a source for such a small number of V6 variants.

Although the ITS regions of all 516 V6-ITS clones were of nearly identical size (360 bp) and > 98% similar to each other, 104 different sequences were detected among the three samples. For samples LC1408 and LC1443 the mutation rate within the ITS region (0.24% and 0.16%) was higher than the mutation rate within the V6 hypervariable region (0.06% and 0.11%), but in sample LC1404 the ITS region exhibited even less variation (0.02%) than in
the V6 (0.04%) (Table 1). The variation in the V6 regions of the V6-ITS clones was substantially lower than that observed for the V6 region of the 16S rRNA clones, even though 34–38 cycles were required for amplification of the V6-ITS clones, compared with 20 cycles for the 16S rRNA clones. We conclude that error introduced during amplification and cloning does not appear to greatly affect the observed trends in ITS sequence variation.

The ITS region of LCMS encodes an Ala-tRNA and shows sequence homology with the ITS regions of several methanogens (Fig. S1). Sequence variations were most commonly associated with two predicted stem-loop structures in the region upstream of the tRNA gene (Fig. 3A). The five most common variations were present in 10–30 clones per library; most positions were variable in no or only one clone (Fig. 3A). The highly non-random distribution of sequence variation along the length of the ITS argues strongly against a large contribution of variation from sequencing error.

Sample LC1408 contained 47 different ITS sequences (Fig. 1), more than LC1404 (23 sequences) or LC1443 (43 sequences). The evenness of sample LC1408 was higher than that of the other samples (Table 1), as the most common sequence comprised just 37.8% of all clones. The greater evenness in LC1408 ITS sequences may be due, in part, to the higher number of cycles required for sufficient PCR amplification of this sample, but this effect is not expected to be large for reasons described above and in Supplementary information. Furthermore, it is intriguing that the ITS clone libraries as well as the V6 tag data sets showed the highest diversity and evenness in sample LC1408 and the least diversity and evenness in sample LC1404 (Table 1). This correspondence between genetic markers and sequencing technologies supports the observed trends as reliable indicators of biological diversity and not artefacts of the methodology.

The ITS region appears to reveal a scale of diversity that is not reflected in 16S rRNA sequences. Compared with the 16S rRNA clone libraries and V6 tag pyrosequencing data sets, the ITS clones showed a more even abundance distribution of sequences (as shown in the higher evenness values in Table 1 and in Fig. S2). Of all 516 V6-ITS clones, 231 contained ITS sequence variations, and eight of these variants occurred more than twice. In contrast, none of the 16S rRNA variants occurred more than twice, so it is possible that many of these variants were generated by sequencing error. Of the 231 clones with variant ITS sequences, 221 clones had identical V6 sequences. The 10 exceptions involved nine different V6 sequences and six different ITS sequences. Thus nearly all of the observed ITS variation is associated with the same dominant V6 sequence, and it is likely that a tag pyrosequencing study of the LCMS biofilm with primers targeting the ITS region would reveal even more microdiversity than the thousands of V6 sequence types found in this study.

Multiple studies have shown that large genomic differences are possible among organisms with only small variations in 16S rRNA sequence (Beja et al., 2002; Welch et al., 2002; Rocap et al., 2003; Thompson et al., 2005), but further work is necessary to determine if the microdiversity reported in our study is associated with larger-scale genomic variations leading to important physiological and ecological consequences. The V6 tag data set alone does not compel rejection of a null hypothesis of ecologically neutral genetic drift within a clonal population because it is possible for the many extremely
rare V6 tag sequences to reflect ‘background’ mutations not yet affected by selection and speciation. The highly non-random nature of the ITS variation, however, provides stronger evidence for ecologically relevant diversity. The markedly different distributions of ITS genotypes among chimney samples (Fig. 3B) may be an indication that the biofilm community contains several distinct subpopulations represented by different ITS genotypes. Determining whether these subpopulations represent physiologically and ecologically distinct units (i.e. ecotypes or species) will require further genomic and physiological experiments. In particular, these experiments should test the hypothesis that differentiation within this one group of archaea is the result of subpopulations colonizing multiple niches within the chimney to maximize utilization of resources that are unavailable to other organisms due to the extreme conditions of Lost City chimneys (Kelley et al., 2005; Brazelton et al., 2006).

The detection of so many rare V6 sequences was only technically feasible in this study due to the extremely low diversity of the Lost City carbonate chimneys. As sequencing technology continues to improve in sensitivity, fidelity and read length, measurements of even finer scale microdiversity and comparisons of variation across multiple genomic markers will become possible for systems with greater diversity. This near-future technology could be used to test whether the rare microdiversity reported here is a natural feature of microbial populations or an unusual characteristic unique to this extremophilic archaeal community.

Acknowledgements

We thank Deborah Kelley, chief scientist, and the scientific parties of the 2003 and 2005 Lost City Expeditions as well as the crews of the R/V Atlantis, DSV Alvin, R/V Ronald H. Brown, and DSV Hercules. We also appreciate technical assistance and helpful discussions with Ekaterina Andreishcheva, Sue Huse and Julie Huber. This research was supported by the W.M. Keck Foundation to M.L.S., the NASA Astrobiology Institute through the Carnegie Institution for Science to J.A.B. and through the MBL to M.L.S.

References


revealed by the complete genome sequence of uropathogenic *Escherichia coli.* *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* **99:** 17020–17024.


**Supporting information**

Additional Supporting Information may be found in the online version of this article:

**Fig. S1.** The LCMS ITS region encodes a tRNA and shows sequence similarity to the ITS regions of several methanogens. The alignment includes sequences from: *Methanoseta thermophila* (NC_008553), *Methanosarcina barkeri* (NC_007349), *Ms. aceticivorans* (NC_003552), *Ms. mazei* (NC_003901), *Methanococcoides burtonii* (NC_007955), *Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicus* (NC_000916), *Methanosphaera stadtmanae* (NC_007681), and Lost City *Methanosarcinales* (GQ273207).

**Fig. S2.** Rank-abundance plot showing the number of clones sharing the 10 most frequently occurring 16S rRNA and ITS sequences in samples LC0424 and LC1408, both of which were collected from the Poseidon chimney (Marker 3). Only one 16S rRNA sequence occurs more than twice, but five ITS sequences occur many times in this sample. As shown in Fig. 3B, other samples contain different abundant ITS sequences.

**Table S1.** Previously published characteristics of the three carbonate chimney samples from which V6 tags and V6-ITS clone libraries were sequenced. Fluid temperatures and concentrations of H2 and CH4 are maximum values reported by Proskurowski and colleagues (2006; 2008). Cell densities and proportions of phylogenetic groups are from Schrenk and colleagues (2004) and M. Schrenk (doctoral dissertation, 2005). Organic carbon concentrations and isotopic measurements are from Bradley and colleagues (2009). Fluid temperature and chemistry are identical for samples LC1404 and LC1443 because these carbonate samples were collected from the same chimney.

Please note: Wiley-Blackwell are not responsible for the content or functionality of any supporting materials supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing material) should be directed to the corresponding author for the article.